

DISCOVERY BAY HILLGROVE VILLAGE OWNERS' COMMITTEE

Minutes of Meeting No 5 2014-2015

held on 4 May 2015, 7:30 pm in Discovery Bay Office Centre

Present:

Mr Edwin Rainbow	(ER)	Chairperson
Mr Lau Man Kit	(LMK)	Vice Chairperson
Ms Alice Li	(AL)	Member
Mr Chung Kwok Wah	(CKW)	Member
Mr Fok Chau Lun	(FCL)	Member
Mr Michael McGuire	(MM)	Member
Ms Nikki Wepener	(NW)	Member
Mr Tze Bo King	(TBK)	Member
Mr G H Koo	(GH)	Manager – Estate, City Management (CM)
Mr Sam Lo	(SL)	Manager – Contracts (CM)
Ms Cherie Lau	(CL)	Assistant Officer – Estate (CM)
Fine Faith Limited	(FF)	Member

Absent with Apologies:

Fine Faith Limited	(FF)	Member
Ms Lo Yuk Shan Connie	(LYS)	Member
Mr Lam Wai Man	(LWM)	Member
Mr Martin Keen	(MK)	Member
Mr Nigel JH Reid	(NR)	Member
Ms. Umehara Yukiko	(UY)	Member

4. Consultancy Service Tender

SL advised the Committee on the discussion of Renovation Working Group (RWG) Meeting No 3 and subsequent opening of the Second Envelop of tender prices, as follows.

- Five (5) tenderers were invited to attend the tender interview of 17 April where the interview panel formed by VOC /RWG members rated the interview performance.
- These tenderers were:
 - ✧ Brightspect Ltd
 - ✧ Ho & Partners Architects Engineers & Development Consultants Ltd
 - ✧ PWL Surveyors Ltd
 - ✧ Trusty Surveyors (HK) Ltd

✧ Wealthy Gate Architects & Associates Ltd

- The Second Envelops of tender prices of these five (5) tenderers were opened on 20 April under the witness of VOC / RWG Members and the RWG Meeting No 3 was conducted in that evening.
- The final scores were computed and the ranks were set out to RWG for consideration.
- RWG felt that service quality should prevail for the reason that quality consultancy services would result in a greater saving on the total project cost.
- It was also agreed to remove the requirement of translation of project document at this stage and this would be separately quoted if needed in the future.
- RWG also proposed to obtain the best offers from these five (5) tenderers.
- The best offers in sealed envelop were received and opened on 28 April under the witness of VOC / RWG Members.

The revised final scores after the opening of best offers were tabled.

To assess the performance and prices submitted by the tenderers, the Committee adopted an elimination approach to select the most suitable consultant. In the first round, Briightspec Ltd was removed in view of the highest price quoted. PWL Surveyors Ltd was then removed in the second round for its lowest score in terms of performance in the interview.

The Committee then reviewed the remaining three (3) consultants and made the following comments on each of them.

Ho & Partners Architects Engineers & Development Consultants Ltd –

- Won the highest score in the tender interview
- An experienced team of project manager, architect and building surveyor who would lead the project, attended the interview
- Intended to spend 4,320 hours in the whole projects whereas the others, about 914-2,670 ~~1,000-2,000~~ hours.
- Demonstrated extensive experience in building surveying and project management.
- Provided practical advice to manage the renovation project, such as ~~Stressed and focused on~~ the importance of pre-qualification of main contractors resulting in quality site work, employment of independent quality surveyor to monitor the construction costs and contracts.
- Delivered a better solution with its architectural and building surveying perspectives.
- Introduced a cost effective approach on façade by gondola system.

Trusty Surveyors (HK) Ltd –

- Showed comparatively less experience than the others.
- Involved in legal case in the past three years.
- Inclined towards building surveying aspect in managing the renovation project with ~~architectural input.~~

Wealthy Gate Architects & Associates Ltd –

- The Project Director of the team showed comparatively less experience than the others.¶
- Committed the least ~~less~~ working hours in this project as compared to the others.

- Submitted tender interview summary after the date as required.
- ~~Handling several projects in Discovery Bay at the time being.~~

CM reminded the Committee that there was an agreed scoring mechanism in selecting the consultant through the assessment of the combination technical / pricing ingredients, which would be reflected in the total score. Selecting a tenderer of lesser scores would deviate from the mechanism. After lengthy discussion, the Committee unanimously agreed to recommend appointing Ho & Partners Architects Engineers & Development Consultants Ltd for this projects and CM would draft issue management notice to update owners about the progress and recommendation accordingly.